|  |
| --- |
| **Peer Response: Comparison/Contrast Essay** |
| *Writer’s Name*:  *Paper Title*:  *Reviewers’ Names*: |
| *Style and Grammar*  Does the paper follow MLA format regarding 1-inch margins, heading, running header, double-spacing, 12pt Times New Roman font, in-text quotations, block quotations, and Works Cited?  Are there repeated grammatical and/or typographical errors? |
| *Thesis and Controlling Idea*  What is the paper’s thesis statement?  Does the thesis guide the reader, structure the paper, and control the analysis?  Does the thesis address both comparison and contrast? |
| *Comparison and Contrast*  Does the paper make a clear comparison between the two films’ traits (option a) or representations (option b)?  Does the paper make a clear contrast between the two films’ traits (option a) or representations (option b)?  Are the comparison and contrast related, i.e., the contrast is derived from the comparison, or vice versa? Are the comparison and contrast sections similar in argumentative and analytical quality and given appropriate weights? |

|  |
| --- |
| *Evidence*  Does the essay avoid plot summary and analyze specific filmic evidence from the two films (dialogue, shots, scenes, lighting, *mise-en-scène*, etc.) to prove its point about the key traits (option a) or representations (option b)? |
| *Organization*  Does each paragraph advance, support, and/or develop the controlling idea, the thesis?  Does each paragraph create and maintain its own internal organization and coherence?  Do the paper’s paragraphs build upon and/or follow one another in logical, effective ways? |
| *Voice*  Is the paper’s voice sufficiently academic and formal, strong and authoritative? |
| *Successes and Weaknesses*  What does the paper do well?  What does it need to work on in the revision? |
| *Quality and Creativity*  Does the paper convince you of its claim, i.e., its filmic interpretation? Why or why not?  Does the paper provide original insight into the film?  Is the paper of sound quality and caliber? |